

DISRUPTION OF BALAGHAH LEARNING MEDIA DURING THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC IN IAIN TULUNGAGUNG

Ahmad Nurcholish^{1*}, Umi Machmudah², Izzatul Laila³ and Shyamala Susan Vincent⁴

¹Institute Agama Islam Negeri (Tulungagung)-Indonesia

²Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim (Malang)- Indonesia

³MTsN 1 Malang, Indonesia

⁴APC Mahalaxmi, Thoothukudi, Tamil Nadu, India

*Corresponding author: cholisahmad87@gmail.com

Abstract

Purpose of the study: The premise of this paper is to describe the disruption of the Balaghah learning media during the covid-19 pandemic in IAIN Tulungagung

Methodology: It is a descriptive study with a qualitative approach. It represents two main descriptions such as the problems of online-based Balaghah learning for IAIN Tulungagung students and Balaghah learning media disturbances during the covid-19 pandemic in IAIN Tulungagung.

Main Findings: The results showed that at the beginning of its implementation, many students well responded to this online class, however, after several times of the courses, many students experienced difficulties in learning. This situation reduces the quality of the teaching and learning process. Most students choose the learning process in the offline class because the students faced some problems while having an online class. The freedom provided, on the other hand, even distracts the students' focus. The disruption of Balaghah learning media during the Covid-19 pandemic in IAIN Tulungagung is the shift from conventional to online-based media such as Zoom Meeting, Google Meet, Google Classroom, and WhatsApp Group.

Novelty/Originality of this study: This research addressed the online learning problems of Balaghah for IAIN students, Tulungagung are the difficulty of receiving Balaghah learning materials related to words and sentences pronunciation, much subject matter that is too hard to understand, lack of student interest and motivation to learn, little time available, network quality in certain areas, as well as an environment that is less supportive of Balaghah learning. The disruption of the Balaghah learning media during the Covid-19 pandemic at IAIN Tulungagung is the use of various online media such as (1) Media with video conference features, Zoom Meeting and Google Meet, (2) Media with low capacity video conferencing features, WhatsApp Group, and (3) Alternative media, Google Classroom.

INTRODUCTION

The Covid-19 outbreak has spread to 215 countries in the world, it challenges educational institutions, especially higher education. To fight Covid-19, the Government asks all people to do social distancing and physical distancing, wear a

mask and wash hands frequently. Through the Ministry of Education and Culture, President Joko Widodo has forbidden all higher education to conduct by self (conventional) lectures and instructional learning online instead [1]. Higher education is guided to do online learning [2].

Many universities have quickly responded to government instructions, including IAIN Tulungagung by issuing letters of instruction on preventing the spread of the coronavirus disease (Covid-19). There are six points of instructions and one of them is a recommendation to implement online learning [3]. There are about 65 universities in Indonesia that have implemented online learning [1]. D. Jamaluddin, T. Ratnasih, H. Gunawan, and E. Paujiah stated that online learning has strengths, challenges, and obstacles [5].

To prevent the spread of Covid-19, WHO has prohibited people to make crowds gather. Therefore, face-to-face learning that gathers a large number of students in the class is not allowed. Lectures must be held in a scenario that can prevent physical contact between students and lecturers and/or students and students [2]. According to Milman, the use of digital technology can enable students and lecturers to carry out the learning process even though they are in different places [6].

No exception, Balaghah learning also uses an online system during the Covid-19 pandemic. According to Moore, Dickson-Deane, and Galyen, online learning is learning that uses internet networks with accessibility, connectivity, flexibility, and the ability to generate various types of learning interactions [7]. Research conducted by Zhang et al., It displays that utilization of internet with multimedia technology completely changed the way of gaining knowledge and became best substitute for traditional classrooms [8]. Online learning is bringing together both the students and teachers in one picture together students for better interactions by using the internet [9].

Balaghah online study needs mobile-based media devices for online teaching implementations like smartphones or android phones, computers laptops, tablets, and i-phones to access information anytime and anywhere you want. [10]. During work from home period, higher education institutions were looking for strong online networks for better online learning [11]. Last few years, online education network is in heavy demand in the world of education [12]. Online education methods are also needed in learning in this industrial revolution 4.0 era [13].

The use of mobile technology has a major contribution to educational institutions [14], including the achievement of Balaghah learning goals using online media. Various online media can be used to support the implementation of Balaghah learning online. For example, virtual classes use Google Classroom, Edmodo, Schoology, and instant messaging applications such as WhatsApp. Online learning can even be done through social media such as Facebook and Instagram.

The use of online-based learning media can connect students with learning resources (databases, experts/instructors, libraries) that are physically separated or

even far apart but they can communicate with each other, interact or collaborate (directly/synchronously and indirectly/asynchronously). Online-based learning media is a form of distance learning that utilizes telecommunications and information technology, for example, the internet, CD-ROOM. The purpose of this study is to obtain an overview of the use of online-based learning media in the Arabic Language Education Study Program of IAIN Tulungagung during the Covid-19 pandemic.

Previous studies related to Balaghah learning and online learning have been conducted by several researchers. Syukro Vadila and Suharmon examined the problems of Balaghah learning [15]. Yanti et al. discussed the use of *Kemendikbud's* learning homepage as an online learning media in elementary schools [16]. Then the research conducted by Sanjaya discussed 21 reflections on online learning during the Covid19 pandemic [17]. Based on this study, studies regarding the disruption of Balaghah learning media during the Covid-19 pandemic have never been carried out comprehensively. This research is offered as an alternative so the Balaghah learning process at Islamic Higher Education (PTKI) continues to run well.

LITERATURE STUDY

Online Learning Media

Education is one tool to build the nation's character [18]. Therefore, in the educational process, the teachers must prone to different education media following conditions. When Covid-19 Pandemic is currently sweeping the world, various sectors are experiencing changes and are required to adapt to the situation. Educational institutions must also transform the learning media during this Covid-19 pandemic.

Media is a supporting tool in the learning process. The success or failure of the learning process is largely determined by the media used. Media is the medium of transferring messages from sender to recipient, it restoring feelings, thinkings, interest, attention, and students' interest through teaching and learning procedure [19]. According to Dabbagh and Ritland, online learning is an open and distributed learning system using pedagogical tools (educational aids), which are made possible through the internet and network-based technology to facilitate the formation of learning and knowledge processes through meaningful actions and interactions [20].

Online learning media can be easily be operated by th users along with a control device. Here the user can control and access as per the needs, such as downloading resources for Tenses material in English lessons [21]. The best part of using online learning media is that independently and with high interactivity you can learn, boost your memory levels, gain more learning experience not only with text but also with audio, video, and animation, used to convey information easily, update content, fast downloading, students can share information through e-mails, post comments on discussion forums, use chat rooms, to video conference links to communicate directly with each other from their home. [22].

According to Dabbagh and Ritland, online learning has three components, namely: (a) study models, (b) instructional and study strategies, (c) online study media [23]. These three components combinely make a interactive relationship, where there is a structured study model as a social process informs about the desing of online learning ambiance. It leads to the specification of instructional and learning strategies that specifically designed for easier accessibility of learning technology.

Offline learning media can be interpreted as media that is not equipped with a control/navigation device that can be used by the user. This media runs sequentially. For example, presentation media are generally not equipped with tools to control what users will do. The presentation runs sequentially as a straight line so they can be called linear media and are usually used when the number of audiences is more than one person, for example, it can be realized on CD [24].

Some of the characteristics of offline learning media according to Dabbagh and Ritland are: (1) integrated learning material, (2) fixed learning time/definite time, (3) controlled by the teacher/instructor, (4) unidirectional/linear learning, (5) the selected information source has been edited, (6) the information source is fixed, (7) the technology used is known. In principle, the use of offline learning media in this study is the same as the use of online media, namely by using the Moodle E-Learning program. In the offline system, students get sources only from teachers and materials that already exist in the Moodle E-Learning program, students cannot access or download via the internet. Students can actively ask only about existing material, students can work on existing questions and can see the results, but each student gets the same questions, not given randomly.

In everyday life, communication has a very important role. Communication is an important media for the formation or personal development of social contact. With communication, someone grows and learns, discovering personality, understanding people, associate, make friendship, hostile, love each other, hate others, and so on. The English term Communication comes from Latin Communication and comes from the word Communis which means the same or the same meaning. In simple terms, communication can be formulated as a process of transferring message contents in the form of symbols from communicators to communicants or sender to recipient [25].

Types of Online Learning Media

The impact of the Covid-19 pandemic in the world of education is the learning media transformation from classroom face-to-face to online learning. Several online learning media can be used as an option, such as:

- a. The first and most widely used online learning media is Whatsapp group.
- b. The next online learning media comes from google, namely the google suite for education.

- c. The next online learning media is *Ruang Guru*.
- d. The next choice is Zenius.
- e. Online Learning Media which is also often used is Zoom.

Based on the above, viewing the situation and conditions during the Covid-19 pandemic, the teacher or lecturer must be smart in choosing learning media to be used in the learning process. Therefore, teachers are required to master many learning media [26].

RESEARCH METHOD

This research uses descriptive qualitative methods. According to Aminuddin, qualitative research aims to describe something or situation [27]. It uses a questionnaire technique. The questionnaire technique is used for data collection by giving a set of questions or written statements to answered by respondents. The research was conducted from September, 13 - 28 2020. The respondents are 100 students from the study program of Arabic Language Education, the teacher training unit, and Tarbiyah Faculties, IAIN Tulungagung.

The data was obtained by filling the questions sheet distributed to all respondents using Google Form. Furthermore, the collected data are analyzed. The elements contained in the questionnaire list consisted of several questions, namely information related to the study program/department, (1) the student's educational background; 2) How Balaghah learning is carried out; (3) Is Balaghah learning carried out according to the class schedule set by the faculty; (4) Is the Balaghah material (teaching material) following the Learning Outcomes; (5) Does Balaghah use teaching materials or modules; (6) What media are used in Balaghah online learning process; (7) Are the respondents familiar with online learning; (8) What problems do the respondents face in learning Balaghah online; (9) What are respondents hopes toward online learning to solve the obstacle in learning Balaghah.

The Data analysis used the Miles & Huberman analysis model which consisted of three stages, namely data reduction, data display, and verification [28]. Limiting data is the process of collecting all the necessary information from the interview results and then assembling them together as data. Data describes is the necessary information exposure in research, which should not be discarded. During verification is the stage of describing research data to draw conclusions are completely based on the obtained phenomena.

FINDINGS

The Problems of Online-based Balaghah Learning for IAIN Tulungagung students

The impact of the coronavirus outbreak is increasing rapidly proven by the increasing number of positive cases in the community. The government has instructed to Work from Home (WFH), people must work remotely from their homes to suppress coronavirus spread chain. Many people have responded well, but some people have not responded well. One of these voices came from students that have to learn from home. Government instructions must also be followed by all students to prevent the spread of the coronavirus. Finally, various alternative learning methods such as online learning are implemented.

At the beginning of its implementation, many students responded well to this online class, however, after the online lecture process was carried out, many students experienced difficulties in learning. This situation reduces the teaching and learning quality for both students and lecturers. Why did this happen? Why is the freedom given to students by learning from home reducing the effectiveness of this learning? Shouldn't it be the other way around?

Some students feel difficult to focus, even though it is more relaxed. An Arabic Language Education Study Program student, Tarbiyah Faculty and Teacher Training unit, IAIN Tulungagung, who has been running online classes since March due to the Covid-19 pandemic explained that he preferred studying on campus because he can focus more. "But by this situation, what else can we do", the student response to a question about the choice of learning method that suits him. This opinion is based on the student experience in following the online learning process.

He continued to explain, not only the task that more pile up, but he also feels a lot of distraction while studying. Face-to-face classes have a different feel, direct interaction tends to support the learning process", said one student about the obstacles to learning online. He added: "I usually keep in touch with friends, can stay active and have interactions. At least it helps trigger the same focus on learning," said the student again about how to build focus during learning activities at home. Based on the experiences of those two students, their opinions tilted towards choosing the learning process on campus. It is based on difficulties when learning with online learning methods. The freedom is given sometimes makes many choices that distract students' focus.

Disruption of Balaghah Learning Media during the Covid-19 Pandemic at IAIN Tulungagung

Online learning carried out by Arabic Language Education Study Program (PBA) FTIK IAIN Tulungagung as an effort to break the Covid-19 spread chain using learning applications that can be accessed via internet network are:

Zoom Meeting

Online learning was announced in mid-March 2020, the students in the PBA class were very enthusiastic about taking online courses. For this reason, they also tried to choose the Zoom service as an online learning media for further Balaghah courses. Most of PBA lecturers facilitate this decision. Zoom is a video conferencing service that has practical capabilities in presenting an online meeting atmosphere. As reported by id.cloudhost.com, active Zoom users have increased rapidly by around 2.22 million per month since the COVID-19 pandemic spread out globally in March 2020. This paid application can be accessed free of charge with a maximum user capacity of 100 people and a conference duration limit of around 40 minutes.

After a meeting of the teaching and learning process, PBA students feel conveniences when using Zoom. This application is equipped with a Sharing Screen feature to facilitate the teachers in present teaching materials like face-to-face meetings in conventional classrooms.

The process of using Zoom media in Balaghah learning in the PBA IAIN Tulungagung is as follows:

1. Lecturers invite students to download <https://zoom.us/support/download>. This application can be used via a cellphone or laptop.
2. Select 'join the meeting' or 'Join Meeting.' Students enter the ID of the lecturer who has provided the password and the meeting ID or invite via email.
3. All students and lecturers can communicate to discuss and chat together via video conference.

The economic background of PBA students is heterogeneous. This fact must be wisely solved to make the online learning process can run fairly. Besides the problem of internet quota, online learning through Zoom sometimes constrained by an unstable signal, it makes internet access does not work well. This factor is caused by the location range of each provider that students use. This factor becomes the most crucial aspect, if the course conducted by Zoom is still forced, not all students can get benefit from the material presented. On the other hand, some students who subscribe to internet access monthly have a better experience in using Zoom.

Google Meet

Some students in other PBA classes use Google Meet as an application for video conferencing. The process of using Google Meet media in Balaghah learning in the PBA IAIN Tulungagung department is as follows:

1. By using WA group, the lecturer explains what Google Meet is, its facilities, and its advantages and disadvantages.
2. After students understand it, then Balaghah courses are started by using Google Meet from home.
3. Sign in to Google.com

4. Click the dotted box of the Google application.
5. Search for Meet and then click the Google Meet app.
6. Click 'start a meeting'. Then the Google Meet Id will appear. This Google Meet id is given by PBA lecturers to PBA students to join the video conference.
7. After getting the Google Meet ID, the students will ask to join the video conference by instruction 'Asking to joint' on the PBA Lecturer smartphone
8. During the discussion, students press Presenting for presentation.
9. To display all connected students, click on the lower right corner of the dots, select 'Change LayOut.'

Google Classroom

After having many meetings using Zoom and Google Meet, there is a new decision from several PBA students and Balaghah lecturers to continue online learning by using Google Classroom. As reported on its official page, edu.google.com, Google states that Google Classroom is an efficient portal service for teachers to manage teaching materials and assignments. Also, from the learner's point of view, Google Classroom has a friendly internet quota, its services like social media which do not require excessive quota to access.

WhatsApp Group (WAG)

To balance the interaction between lecturers and students in the Google Classroom, PBA students create a WhatsApp group according to their respective classes. The function of the group chat is as a complementary media. In WhatsApp Group, PBA lecturers often send additional explanations via audio recordings, so the learning materials can be conveyed not only by text but also through voice notes.

Apart from all the problems in WAG, the use of Whatsapp Group media is still very popular among PBA students, because it has many advantages such as:

1. Widely used, especially for students (Whatsapp users worldwide more than one billion people).
2. Easy to install in a smartphone (it only takes a few steps to install).
3. The installation data is very low (only about 18 MegaBytes to download).
4. High chat acceleration (many users use Whatsapp application because of its speed in sending messages).
5. Can be used to send files, pictures, voice messages, videos, GPS, web posts/links, emojis, and so on.
6. You can use bold, italic, and underline features which are very useful, for example for word affirmation of certain words and terms.
7. You can also know the status of the message recipient, namely one white tick for a pending message, two white ticks means the message has been received and

not read/opened, and two blue ticks as a sign that the message has been received and read.

DISCUSSION

Related to the problems of online-based Balaghah Learning among IAIN Tulungagung Students, the researchers believe that this phenomenon can be seen from a psychological point of view, it is something new for students so the obstacles occur are more about habits. At first, it welcomed because the students feel something different, but after several meetings, the students were bored with the everyday routine.

Distraction makes focus is difficult to build, sometimes it is influenced by external forces. In general, there are two principles, namely the pleasure principle and rule principle. The pleasure principle is based on the urge to do something that is loved and interested to do. It builds focus because you like the subject. The second is the rule principle, it based on the urge to do something because of the demands that have consequences. These principles can also encourage someone's willingness to do something and encourage focus.

There is also a solution to solve these distractions, for example, if you want to build focus you must know what principles dominate us. Is it the pleasure principle or the rule principle? If one is more dominant, we can try to balance it. For example, you prefer to learn while eating, but what happens if it just makes you don't focus. Then don't eat first, you can eat after studying. Another example, before morning online classes, you have to take a shower first, then have breakfast, so the focus is awakened because of the rules we apply.

If you like playing games but there are more important demands. Supposedly, this makes the game a reward after doing important things to be done first, for example taking an online class. Based on these suggestions, as a student, one must be good at choosing principles. Is it the pleasure principle or the rule principle. If you already know, then you need to try to balance it. The hope is that you must be able to build a focus, especially in learning activities from home.

Related to the disruption of Balaghah learning media during the Covid-19 pandemic at IAIN Tulungagung, most of PBA students think that Zoom is better. On the other hand, there are also different responses. After being evaluated, most of PBA students thought that lecturing through Zoom drained their internet quota. Even though, according to the results of the online conference application comparison test reported by CNBCIndonesia.com, it is stated that Zoom has the lowest level of bandwidth requirements, which is around 700 Kbps. When compared with Skype with 977 Kbps, Hangouts with 1100 Kbps, and WebEx with 1,700 Kbps.

Apart from the use of Zoom, some students in other PBA classes use Google Meet as for video conferencing. Then, they move to Google Classroom. Besides its convenience, some students feel different. According to them, Google Classroom

eliminates the interaction side between teachers and learners, especially in terms of teaching foreign languages like the Balaghah course. According to them, the interaction between teacher and learner is a little bit lost because the interactions that exist in this virtual class are only channeled through text in the comments column, in contrast to direct interaction patterns such as those found in the Zoom and Google Meet applications. This will certainly make it difficult for lecturers to assess students personally, considering that learning Arabic is learning a foreign language, which requires personal skills for each student in mastering it.

Unfortunately, from the implementation of two alternative platforms both Google Classroom and WhatsApp group, PBA students found another obstacle, which is less responsive communication habits. Some of them admitted that they were embarrassed and lacked confidence in Balaghah, so the lecturers' explanation recorded via WhatsApp voice note just missed away without any feedback.

CONCLUSION

The problems of online-based Balaghah learning for IAIN Tulungagung students are the difficulty of understanding and accepting Balaghah learning materials related to the pronunciation of words and sentences, too many subjects that difficult to understand, lack of student interest and motivation, the limited time available, internet networks problem in certain areas as well as the less supportive environment to Balaghah learning.

The disruption of Balaghah learning media during the Covid-19 pandemic in IAIN Tulungagung is the shift of learning media from conventional to online-based media. Balaghah the Arabic Learning Language Education Study Program of IAIN Tulungagung uses various online media such as (1) Media with video conference features, Zoom Meeting and Google Meet, (2) Media with low capacity video conference features, WhatsApp Group, and (3) Alternative media, Google Classroom.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This paper is a part of the paper which has been presented at Internasional Conference on Education, Management, and Social Science (ICEDUMAS 2020) Malang-Indonesia, and the authors wish to acknowledge the rector of Institut Agama Islam Negeri Tulungagung, Indonesia who has supported this research.

REFERENCES

- [1] Surat Edaran Kemendikbud Dikti No. 1 tahun 2020.
- [2] F. Firman dan S. Rahayu, Pembelajaran Online di Tengah Pandemi Covid-19. *Indonesian Journal of Educational Science (IJES)*, Vol. 2, No. 2, 2020, pp. 81-89.
- [3] Surat Edaran Rektor IAIN Tulungagung No. 147 tahun 2020.
- [4] J. L. Moore, C. Dickson-Deane dan K. Galyen, E-Learning, Online Learning, And Distance Learning Environments: Are They The Same? *Internet and Higher Education*, 2011, 67, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jheduc.2010.10.001>.
- [5] Jamaluddin, D., Ratnasih, T., Gunawan, H., & Paujiah, E. (2020). Pembelajaran Daring Masa Pandemi Covid-19 Pada Calon Guru: Hambatan, Solusi Dan Proyeksi. *LP2M*.
- [6] Milman, N. B. (2015). Distance Education. In *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Behavioral Sciences: Second Edition*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-097086-8.92001-4>.
- [7] Moore, J. L., Dickson-Deane, C., & Galyen, K. (2011). E-Learning, online learning, and distance learning environments: Are they the same? *Internet and Higher Education*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jheduc.2010.10.001>.
- [8] Zhang, D., Zhao, J. L., Zhou, L., & Nunamaker, J. F. (2004). Can E-Learning Replace Classroom Learning?. *Communications of the ACM*. <https://doi.org/10.1145/986213.986216>
- [9] Kuntarto, E. (2017). Keefektifan Model Pembelajaran Daring dalam Perkuliahan Bahasa Indonesia di Perguruan Tinggi. *Indonesian Language Education and Literature*, 3(1).
- [10] Gikas, J., & Grant, M. M. (2013). Mobile Computing Devices In Higher Education: Student Perspectives On Learning With Cellphones, Smartphones & Social Media. *Internet and Higher Education*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jheduc.2013.06.002>
- [11] Darmalaksana, W. (2020). WhatsApp Kuliah Mobile . *Didital Library Fakultas Ushuluddin UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung*.
- [12] W. He, G. Xu, dan S. Kruck, Online is Education for the 21st Century . *Journal of Information Systems Education*. Vol. 3, No. 1, 2014, 88.
- [13] R. A. Pangondian, P. I. Santosa, dan E. Nugroho, Faktor-Faktor Yang Mempengaruhi Kesuksesan Pembelajaran Daring Dalam Revolusi Industri 4.0, *Seminar Nasional Teknologi Komputer & Sains (SAINTEKS)* Vol. 1, No. 1, 2019, 90.
- [14] A. T. Korucu, dan A. Alkan, Differences Between M-Learning (Mobile Learning) And Elearning, Basic Terminology And Usage Of M-Learning In Education, *Procedia*

- *Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 2011, 65, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2011.04.029>.

[15] Syukro Vadika dan Suharmon, Problematika Pembelajaran Bahasa Arab di Madrasah Aliyah Negeri (MAN) Batu Mandi Tilatang Kaman, *Jurnal of Education*, Vol. 2, No. 1, 2019, 67.

[16] M. T. Yanti, E. Kuntarto, dan, A. R. Kurniawan, Pemanfaatan Portal Rumah Belajar Kemendikbud Sebagai Model Pembelajaran Daring di Sekolah Dasar. *Adi Widya: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar*, Vol. 5, No. 1, 2020, pp. 61-68.

[17] R. Sanjaya (Ed.), *21 Refleksi Pembelajaran Daring di Masa Darurat*, (Jakarta: SCU Knowledge Media, 2020), 56.

[18] Ulyan Nasri, *Bersahabat dengan Ilmu: Sebuah Pengantar Filsafat Ilmu*, (Mataram: CV. Haramain Lombok, 2018), cet. Ke-5, xiii-xv.

[19] Ahmad Arsyad, *Media Pembelajaran*, (Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada, 2005), 45.

[20] N. Dabbagh and B. B. Ritland, *Online Learning, Concepts, Strategies And Application*, (Ohio: Pearson, 2005), 78.

[21] Joseph A. DeVito, *Komunikasi Antarmanusia Edisi Kelima*, Alih Bahasa Maulana Agus, (Tangerang Selatan : Karisma, 2011), 67.

[22] Gordon Dryden and J. Vos, *Revolusi Cara Belajar*, (Bandung: Kaifa, 2001), 47.

[23] Dabbagh, N. and Ritland. B. B. (2005). *Online Learning, Concepts, Strategies And Application*. Ohio: Pearson.

[24] R. Rada, *Understanding Virtual Universities*, (USA: Intellect, 2001), 87.

[25] Muhammad, *Komunikasi Organisasi*, (Yogyakarta: Bumi Aksara, 2007), 35.

[26] S, Nasution, *Berbagai Pendekatan Dalam Proses Belajar dan Mengajar*, (Jakarta: Bumi Aksara, 2008), 65.

[27] Aminudin, *Tujuan, Strategi dan Model dalam Penelitian Kualitatif*, (dalam *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif : Tinjauan Teoritis dan Praktis*), (Malang: Lembaga Penelitian UNISMA, 2019), 48.

[28] Matthew B. Miles and A. Michael Huberman, *Analisis Data Kualitatif*, Trans. Tjejep Rohendi, (Jakarta: Universitas Indonesia. 2012), 89.